Fundación Karisma



Women's Rights Online A research and policy advocacy initiative on women's empowerment through the web

Country Report
COLOMBIA

With support from



and the Sweden International Development Cooperation Agency



August 2015

ABOUT

The <u>Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency</u>, Sida, is a government agency working on behalf of the Swedish parliament and government, with the mission to reduce poverty in the world. Through our work and in cooperation with others, we contribute to implementing Sweden's Policy for Global Development

Established by the inventor of the Web, Sir Tim Berners-Lee, the <u>World Wide Web Foundation</u> seeks to establish the open Web as a global public good and a basic right, creating a world where everyone, everywhere can use the Web to communicate, collaborate and innovate freely. The World Wide Web Foundation operates at the confluence of technology and human rights, targeting three key areas: Access, Voice and Participation.

<u>Karisma Foundation</u> is a woman-driven, digital rights NGO, hoping to continue its future work in the defense of freedom of expression, privacy, access to knowledge and due process through research and advocacy from gender perspective, filling a much-needed void in Colombia. Karisma focus has been politics at the intersection of human rights and digital technology. Karisma has worked with diverse communities, including: Librarians, journalists, persons with visual disability, women's rights advocates to strengthen the defense of human rights in digital spaces. Karisma often works jointly with other NGOs and networks that support their actions and projects.

Check this report on-line at:

https://karisma.org.co/lanzamiento-del-informe-womenrightsonline/



Women's Rights Online: A research and policy advocacy initiative on women's empowerment through the web – Colombia by Amalia Toledo is available under a <u>Creative Commons Attribution 4.0</u>
<u>International License.</u>

This license lets you distribute, remix, tweak, and build upon this work, even commercially, as long as you give credit to the author of the original creation.

Karisma Foundation, in a continuing effort to make its documents more accessible—that it, in a format that allow the content to be read by as many people as possible, regardless of their disability or context of use—linked the bibliographical sources in the content itself. However, the bibliographical sources utilized can be found in the References section

Index

EX	CUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1.	INTRODUCTION	8
	1.1 Background to the study	8
	Population	8
	Poverty	8
	Millennium Development Goals (MDG)	9
	Context of internet and information society	9
	Context of women's rights	11
	1.2 Background review of policy, legal, social context of women and the web/ICTs	12
2.	METHODOLOGY	16
3.	DATA ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS	17
	3.1 Demographics of the sample	17
	3.2 Landscape of access to and use of information	
	and communications platforms (ICTs, internet)	17
	3.3 State of women's empowerment on and through the web	19
	Women's agency and safety	20
	Public institutional participation (particularly in the context	
	of urban poverty)	22
	Access to associational/collective action spaces	23
	Access to economic opportunity	23
4.	POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS	25
	REFERENCES	28

Women's rights online

ME	THODOLOGY ANNEX	31
	Background	31
	Overview of the Survey Methodology	31
	Questionnaire	32
	Ethical Code of Conduct	33
	Informed Consent	34
	Pilot Test of the Survey	34
	Sampling Frameworks	35
	Sampling stages	38
	Quota sampling	39
	Survey Fieldwork	40
	Interviewer training & briefing	40
	Survey Fieldwork teams	40
	Survey Fieldwork dates	41
	Survey Interview duration	41
	Substitution and replacement of sampling units	41
	Survey Fieldwork challenges and limitations	41
	Quality control in Survey Research	42
	Field checks	42
	Data & validation checks	43
	Data processing	43
	Qualitative Research Methodology	44
	Qualitative research method	44
	Some Basic Assumptions	45
	Limitations to the study	45
	NOTES	46

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Colombia is a country, in which inequalities abound between the rich and the poor, between urban and rural areas, and between women and men. These inequalities are particularly distinct when considering access to and use of the internet. For example, fixed internet penetration is around 20 percent in the urbanized areas of the department of Risaralda (22.3%), and the Capital District of Bogotá, but does not reach 1% in the eastern departments of Amazonas, Guanía, Guaviare, Vichada, and Vaupés. Colombia has one of the most expensive fixed internet monthly costs in the region, with affordability being the main reason why people do not access the internet. There exists no official disaggregated data about gender inequalities in access to the Internet.

This report seeks to rectify the lack of knowledge about the particular barriers women face in access and using the internet in Colombia. In addition to research and quantitative interviews, this study incorporates the results of a household face-to-face survey conducted in urban poor residential areas in Colombia, commissioned by the World Wide Web Foundation and carried out by Ipsos MORI. The survey was part of a series conducted in 10 countries around the world, including Cameroon, Colombia, Egypt, India, Indonesia, Kenya, Mozambique, Nigeria, Philippines and Uganda. A quota sample of 1,011 face-to-face interviews was completed with 254 men and 757 women between the ages of 18 and 60 living in urban poor areas.

The research reveals that while the majority of respondents, men and women alike, considered themselves internet users, and there are not significant gender disparities in the numbers of respondents who access the internet on a daily basis via their mobile phone, across the board men have more access to computers than women, are more likely to have a smartphone than women, and make more use of social media than women. Men use the internet more often to access information about health, legal issues, and government services.

Encouragingly, however, the gender disparities are not hugely pronounced, and the women and men surveyed believed overwhelmingly that men and women should have an equal access to the internet and to online content. This may reflect the digital literacy and equality initiatives in place in the district of Bogota, where the study was undertaken, such as the *Mujeres TIC* (ICT Women) and *Mujeres Digitales* (Digital women, implemented in Medellín) initiatives focusing on the development of women's job skills, and the empowerment of those capabilities through the use of ICT. The Ministry of ICT (MinTIC, in Spanish) trained around 50,000 women on digital literacy prior to 2012, while the High Council for Gender Equality also runs as strategic communications campaign called "Women have rights," intended to advance transformative processes to combat violence environments against women and establish healthcare protocols for displaced women in the offline world.

Unlike in many of the countries surveyed, the female respondents in Colombia did not report a high frequency of harassment or violence online, and around 40 percent of women believe the internet provides them with a more secure space to express them. However, this study also looked in depth at the online experience of women journalists in Colombia through in-depth interviews, and observed that women journalists experience innumerable cases of online violence, for the work they do, but above all for being a woman. The characteristics of the violence that women journalists faced are different from the men: messages conveying sexist stereotypes, aggressive, sexual, where the body is the weapon and battleground for this type of violence. Bullying does not fall on the ideas, the arguments, but rather on the fact that it is a woman who expresses an opinion, who has a say. The effects of such violence on women journalists are different: from changing habits such as closing online and social media accounts or self-censorship, as well as switching their journalistic practices to offline platforms because the web is conceived as a violent environment. Those who report their experiences to state authorities are often greeted with slow or nonexistent responses: law enforcement officials receiving complaints usually do not know how to handle them, have precarious resources or do not understand the threats, as for them they seem to have no real consequences on the victim. Rectifying the state response to online violence and harassment of women must therefore be a priority for the Colombian government.

Overall, this report contends that, even in underprivileged communities, the internet is already a reality for women and men, and there are not momentous gender inequalities in terms of internet access. However, what is still missing in Colombia is realizing the value of internet as a tool for empowerment and realization of rights. Women use the internet primarily as a tool for their social relations/activities, to meet new people, and for entertainment. Few use it as a political tool to inform and to be informed. Based on this conclusion, there is an opportunity to address the challenge

of expanding the use of the internet as a democratic tool and to empower women if the government includes the gender perspective in its ICT digital agenda. Until now, none of the programmes developed under this agenda addressed the gender gaps and differences. The results of this survey should prompt the government to implement actions that encourage, enable and promote internet use beyond social relations/activities and entertainment, to allow for the full realization of the potential of the internet for women's rights.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background to the study

Population¹

Colombia is politically organized into 32 decentralized departments, which are formed by a grouping of municipalities, and the Capital District of Bogotá. By 2015, the total population in Colombia was 48,203,405 inhabitants; 36,846,935 inhabitants living in urban areas and 11,356,470 in rural areas.

According to the last <u>census</u> conducted in the country in 2005, 91.6 percent of the population over 15 years is literate. The female literacy rate reached 91.8 percent, while for men was 91.3 percent. In urban areas, 94.5 percent of the indicated population knows to read and write, among which 94.4% are women and 94.6 percent are men. Instead, rural area experiences a slightly lower literacy rate: 81.5% nationwide, 81.8 percent for women and 81.1 percent for men.

Poverty²

In 2012, the per capita income of the unit cost was estimated at 500,531 Colombian pesos (COP), in urban areas is COP 590,661 and COP 207,235 in rural areas. In the thirteen metropolitan areas³, it was estimated at COP 709,155, while for the rest of the urban areas it was COP 418,744.

The percentage of people in poverty nationwide by 2012 was estimated at 32.7 percent, 28.4 percent in urban areas, and 46.8 percent in rural areas. In the thirteen metropolitan areas, the proportion of people living in poverty is 18.9 percent and for other urban areas is 42.2 percent. Nationwide, people living in extreme poverty (when the

income is insufficient to buy essential nutrients) were estimated at 10.4 percent, in urban areas, 6.6 percent and in rural areas, 22.8 percent.

The Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI), an indicator that reflects the degree of people deprivation in a set of dimensions⁴, noted in 2012 that 27.0 percent of the population in Colombia was poor. In urban areas, the percentage of people living in poverty by the MPI was 20.6 percent, while 48.3 percent rural populations were poor.

Millennium Development Goals (MDG)

According to the Monitoring Report of the Millennium Development Goals for 2014, Colombia was committed to reduce by 2015 the incidence of extreme poverty to 8.8 percent and monetary poverty to 28.5 percent. In 2013, the level of extreme poverty reached 9.1 percent of the Colombian population, 0.3 percentage points above the 2015 target. In the municipal capitals, extreme poverty was 6 percent of the population and the rest of the country reached 19.1 percent (3.2 times extreme urban poverty). The percentage of people living in poverty in 2013 was 30.6 percent, 2.1 percentage points off the target set for 2015. For this year, poverty in the capital cities was 26.9 percent and 42.8 percent for the rest of the country, with large disparities among departments.

Context of internet and information society

Internet access in Colombia has improved significantly in recent years. According to the Colombian Ministry of ICT's Quarterly ICT Report: Figures for the first quarter of 2015, broadband internet connection⁵ is constantly growing, reaching a total of 10,112,622 inhabitants (around 20 percent of the population). It is noteworthy that according to the socioeconomic classification of residential strata, the broadband internet connection in the lower two strata⁶ was 14.8 percent and 18.4 percent. For the same period, the fixed internet penetration rate nationwide was 11 percent, with the department of Risaralda (22.3 percent), the Capital District of Bogotá (19.4 percent), and the department of Antioquia (14.3 percent) enjoying the highest levels of penetration. However, a great disparity was noted when compared to the other departments; for example, the internet penetration rate does not reach 1 percent in the eastern departments of Amazonas, Guanía, Guaviare, Vichada, and Vaupés. In addition, most households still have no computer or internet service. The main reason for not having internet service, according to the DANE's Survey on Quality of Life (2012) is that it is very expensive, indeed, Colombia has one of the most expensive fixed internet monthly costs in the region.

As for access to mobile phone, the <u>country has recently experienced a considerable growth</u> in mobile phone ownership subscribers who pay a monthly fee represent a total of 5,413,313, while mobile phone on demand reached 23,529,825.

The available data is not disaggregated by gender, age or other status, which hinders the ability to obtain reliable figures on gender gap and the percentage of women accessing these services.

It is worth noting the progress made in Colombia with respect to five efficiency indicators⁷ of information society, as examined in an annual report prepared by the Regulatory Commission of Telecommunications (CRC, in Spanish). In its latest report of 2014, the CRC highlighted the following results: in infrastructure and access to ICTs, Colombia has shown progress in recent years, especially when it comes to mobile phone subscriptions, which reached 108.3 percent in 2013. The most commonly used type of Colombian households connection is the fixed internet with 29.1 percent. But as previously mentioned, the biggest challenge to increasing this percentage is the internet cost connection.

The use of ICT by enterprises showed a steady increase from 2010 to 2012. Although each day enterprises make more intensive use of the internet to find information, for electronic transactions or to provide customer services, micro-enterprises still have low internet presence.

In regards to education, the report noted that the number of students per computer by March 2013 was 11 students per computer. School connectivity overall, however, has been decreasing, although the connectivity in the municipalities has gradually increased. The e-Government indicators have remained at 100 percent: all governmental entities have a presence on internet in their own website or the website of another entity, as well as the percentage of government entities that offer some service platforms to its users (i.e. web, fixed phone, mobile phone) and the percentage of government institutions offering online services (i.e. online inquiries, online complaints, online payments, etc.).

The country has an ambitious ICT policy framework, known as the <u>Vive Digital Plan</u>, which began in 2010 and in 2014 was renewed for another 4 years. With this plan, the government seeks to expand and develop the domestic internet digital ecosystem. The plan for 2015-2018 promotes 4 components: infrastructure, services, applications and users. Among the plan's initiatives, it can be found those that are intended to improve connectivity in the country and create more public internet access centers, implement subsidy schemes for the connection in the poorest populations, deliver computers to educational institutions, and foster national development of mobile applications and digital content, the responsible use of ICT, the use of technologies by ethnic communities, among others.

In the construction of both versions of the Vive Digital Plan, the government put the draft documents to public discussion in the form of online forums. However and albeit the government's good intentions, it failed to provide a clear citizen participa-

tion methodology and a suitable platform for the citizens to comment and assess the agenda (the MinTIC's Facebook page was the platform available for citizen participation). Undoubtedly, this hinders the participation and transparency of the process. Moreover, for the renewal of the plan in 2014, citizen participation was limited to assess the policy on the basis of an info graphic of the 4 components of the plan. The complete draft policy for 2015-2018 was never available during the review process in which citizens were invited to provide inputs.

Many of the programs listed and assessed below are part of the Vive Digital Plan, although it has been mentioned other strategies implemented by subnational governments for the appropriation and use of ICT.

Context of women's rights

Colombia has ratified all international treaties on human rights and women's rights. It has also shown significant progress in the development of laws to promote gender equality and ensure the human rights of women. Examples include the <u>Public Policy Guidelines for Gender Equality for Women and the Comprehensive Plan to guarantee women a life free of violence</u> (2012), as well as the <u>Victims and Land Restitution Act</u> (2011), with important provisions on gender equality. Additionally, it has enacted laws on <u>violence and discrimination against women</u> (2008) and <u>access to justice for women victims of sexual violence</u>, especially during the armed conflict (2014), among others.

The Political Constitution of Colombia, in its <u>article 13</u>, recognizes the right to equality and prohibits discrimination based on sex. In addition, it establishes that the state must foster real and effective equality and must take affirmative actions for marginalized and discriminated groups. <u>Article 43</u>, on the other hand, guarantees equal rights and opportunities for women and men, and that women cannot be subjected to any form of discrimination. Hence, the Colombian law in every area of people's life safeguards equality between women and men; their family and personal relationships, in the workplace, in political participation, etc.

Moreover, <u>Colombian jurisprudence has reaffirmed</u> that there is not only equality before the law, but before the fulfillment of rights. That jurisprudence has had a major regulatory development in recognition of the historical and structural discrimination against women in the promotion of effective equality of women and the eradication of such discrimination.

But despite the legal and jurisprudential protection of the right to equality, Colombian women still face discrimination, which affect and hinder the exercise of their rights and the expansion of their capabilities. The gap between the recognition of rights and their exercise for most women in Colombia is still considerable.

1.2 Background review of policy, legal, social context of women and the web/ICTs

The digital divide between men and women in Colombia is evident: women's access to and use of ICT is less when compared with men. The High Council for Gender Equality reports that while 70 percent of men regularly access internet, just 56 percent of women do so. This same report notes that in terms of access to websites, there is only a difference of 5 percent between men and women (40 percent and 35 percent, respectively). As for access to personal computers, it is evident that the difference between men and women do not represent big disparities. However, the slight difference shows that 26 percent men use personal computers frequently, as opposed to 20 percent of women.

The same report notes that by February 2012 the Ministry of ICT (MinTIC, in Spanish) has trained a total of 49,866 women on digital literacy as part of the Vive Digital Plan. These trainings aimed to transfer skills in basic computer and internet use, as well as in the use of word processing software. This initiative goes hand in hand with a 2010 strategic communications campaign called "Women have rights," implemented by the government and intended to advance transformative processes to combat violence environments against women and to establish healthcare protocols for displaced women in the offline world.

These initiatives are worth mentioning as they aim to generate employment and job skills, as well as to increase abilities to empower women through technology. It should be recognized that the ICT training process is a first step that must be guaranteed by the state. Nevertheless, this program is lacking a component that focuses on building processes for a true appropriation of technology as a tool for women's political and citizen participation, as well as for the protection and exercise of rights in digital spaces.

There are other programmes that have been led by the Capital District of Bogota and the department of Antioquia, through <u>Mujeres TIC</u> [ICT Women] and <u>Mujeres Digitales</u> [Digital Women], respectively, which are of much relevance. Both initiatives focus on the development of women's job skills, and the empowerment of those capabilities through the use of ICT. More recently, in Bogotá, the NGO Colnodo and various public agencies conducted a series of training on ICTs for women from different part of the city as part of the "<u>Training for Equal Opportunities for Women through ICT</u>" project.

In addition, there are initiatives promoted by both state and civil society actors focusing on digital literacy and safety on the internet. On the one hand, as part of Colombia's <u>Vive Digital Plan</u>, the MinTIC has been developing responsible use of ICT programmes, in the form of a digital platform known as <u>En TIC Confio</u> [I trust in ICT], which aim to raise awareness on how implement safe practices on the internet,

covering topics such as cyber dependency, phishing, grooming, child pornography, cyberbullying and sexting. The program is significant, but it seems to lack a gender perspective and is intended, above all, for "students, teachers, parents, business, media and in general all ICT users." Another significance initiative that is foster by public and private entities, as well as civil society organization, is *Te Protejo* [I protect you], a digital channel for reporting illegal content such as sexual abuse, commercial sexual exploitation and pornography, intended to make internet a safer place for children and youth.

On the other hand, civil society has been addressing some of the above-mentioned subjects. For instance, Karisma Foundation has been supporting other civil society organizations in processes that seek to provide <u>information to women about types of online aggressions</u> that can be exercised in the digital and technical spaces, and to provide some legal and social mechanism to report such abuses. This initiative <u>showed</u> that there are no appropriate institutional and legal mechanisms that could allow women to effectively report online violence, since there is no body of law that addresses such violence. Furthermore, it was identified that neither government entities nor law enforcement officials understand the issue as to respond timely and accurately to these abuses.

Another important aspect is that there is little self-awareness of women about protecting their privacy on the internet. While the web is an important space for the fulfillment and realization of rights, the internet's potential remains unknown, as well as the use that it can provide to women to empower themselves and demand the protection of their rights. In addition, the internet is not necessarily perceived as a place where, like in the offline world, self-care is required. In this regard, it is worth mentioning once again the *En TIC Confio* platform, which provide tools to citizens about how to apply safety practices on the internet and prevent abusive situations. However, as previously mentioned, the platform does not address comprehensively gender-based violence online, but rather provides general advice for citizens to protect their online communications and activities.

Definitely, this platform provides an important mechanism to protect the privacy and rights of citizens. Despite this, it does not respond adequately to dynamics that prevail on the internet. That is, a space that allows women to understand internet as a place where, like in the offline world, they can fully exercise their rights, and where they can demand from the state proper attention when their rights are violated. Focusing only on digital risks discourages women from using web-enabled technology for effective empowerment processes. Instead, the state must create and improve existing paths to provide clear and reliable solutions and responses to violations of rights in online environments.

All this become more important if it is acknowledged that the law enforcement and intelligence officers have a great technological capacity to massively intercept com-

munications of all Colombian citizens. Therefore, as the 2015 Privacy International report, entitled <u>A shadow state: security and public order in Colombia</u>, noted the Colombians' communications traffic is being passively collected by various state surveillance systems. And the Colombian legal framework is sufficiently broad and weak to make this possible.

For instance, there are <u>rules that prevent ordinary citizens to encrypt voice calls</u>, being only allowed to high government officials. This <u>prohibition is in force since 1997</u>, avoiding that people encrypt their calls, but also speak in unintelligible language. This law has been systematically renewed until today without any analysis and public debate on its necessity and proportionality, despite the profound technological changes.

This technological and legal context on the security and privacy of communications, along with the rapid growth of mobile telephony, makes more urgent the need to sensitize the population about ways to protect their privacy and to secure their communications, particularly among vulnerable groups such as women, children and youth.

As for net neutrality, this principle is recognized under the Colombian law. Article 56 of Law 1540 of 2011, still in force in the recently approved National Development Plan for 2014-2018 states that internet service providers cannot block, interfere with, discriminate or restrict the user's right to use, send, receive or offer any lawful content, service or application on the web. However, Resolution 3502 of 2011 of the Communication Regulatory Commission, which regulates the said law, does not adequately safeguard net neutrality. This norm allows internet service providers to restrict access to services, content and application on the internet in order to ensure fair competition and sustainability of the market; it permits market segmentation. Additionally, it should be noted that these regulations do not integrate a gender perspective.

Furthermore, in January 2015, Colombia became the fourth country in the world to host the Facebook initiative, internet.org. The official launch counted on the support and promotion by the Colombian government itself, which stated that in addressing the problem of the digital divide in connectivity "it is better to have some access that none." And, certainly, this project is far from providing universal access to internet, because, among other reasons, it provides access to a few applications – in Colombia, 16 applications – that cannot been chosen by the end-user. Furthermore, users of internet.org accept diminished <u>privacy and security</u> protections in exchange for access to the service.

It is alto important to point out that the Colombian Constitutional Court, in 2015, while studying a "right to be forgotten" case, <u>recognized the net neutrality principle</u> as a guarantee for freedom of expression and equal opportunities on the Internet. A vision wider that the legal framework in place in Colombian and that opens up an opportunity for safeguarding net neutrality in the country from a human rights perspective.

Colombia has a comprehensive regulatory framework to guarantee a life free of violence for women and a national public policy to ensure gender equity. However, this does not address situations involving gender-based violence in digital spaces. In addition, regulations on access to ICTs have not mainstreamed any gender approach. That is, there is no solid policy to empower women through the use of ICT, beyond the digital literacy processes for the development of employment and job skills.

As for social response, many traditional women's rights groups and organization call for greater penalties for digital aggression cases. However, the issue is addressed obliquely and limited to cases with resonance in the media. In an attempt to bring the problem to the public arena, last year, as part of the international campaign "16 days of activism against gender violence," Karisma and the NGO Colnodo put in place an online tool offering possible ways to act and some advice on how to protect privacy on the web.

As discussed above, another reaction of the government is to implement digital literacy training, which seem to not covering aspects beyond improving women's digital skills. For the 2010-2014 period, the Vive Digital Plan's basic digital literacy capacity building program trained a total of 276,455 persons from strata 1 and 2, of which 160,608 women and 115,847. While this is a good effort, much remains to be done in order to make web-enabled technology a tool for women's empowerment.

In terms of content production, the Colombian copyright law does not provide a suitable environment for the creation of online content, as it is outdated in terms of digital technological development and new emerging practices. However, it is expected that, as part of the US-Colombia Free Trade Agreement, a copyright reform will be undertook soon. This reform, among others, will include an intermediary liability regime. The government approach to this issue remains uncertain.

On the other hand, there are cases of content blocking for copyright infringement in Colombia, mainly motivated by the US Digital Millennium Copyright Act. One of the most notorious cases involves the blocking of a video of a person of high incidence in the community, leader of one of the Christian churches with more believers in the country and associated with a political party, which was posted by an online media outlet. Cases like this one have enabled Karisma and other civil society organizations to draw attention to the need for a balanced copyright law, where copyright can be weighed against the implications for the exercise of fundamental rights such as free speech.

2. METHODOLOGY

The World Wide Web Foundation commissioned Ipsos MORI to conduct a household face-to-face survey in urban poor residential areas in 10 countries. The survey was conducted in the capital cities or main economic hubs of each country which included: Cairo, Egypt; Bogota, Colombia; Jakata, Indonesia; Kampala, Uganda; Lagos, Nigeria; Manila, Philippines; Maputo, Mozambique; Nairobi, Kenya; New Delhi, India; and Yaounde, Cameroon.

A quota sample of 1,000 face-to-face interviews was completed with 250 men and 750 women between the ages of 18 and 60 living in urban poor areas. The focus of the data collection was on women, hence the larger sample of women and smaller sample of men. The latter – albeit relatively small sample – is useful for comparative purposes and to provide indication of the gender gap in ICT and internet use in each city.

This qualitative research project focused on the issue of online gender based violence against women journalists in Colombia. The diagnosis of the situation was conducted through 3 focus groups, in which 25 persons participated, among which only two were men. In addition, an online survey was conducted. A total of 34 persons – 26 women and 8 men – responded the online survey. With these activities, Fundación Karisma was able to characterize the online violence, and to identify the most common subject matters generating the violence, most common online services in which threats or cyber bullying occurs, consequences to women journalists, and reactions from authorities or online services.

3. DATA ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

3.1 Demographics of the sample

The sample of the Colombian research is 1011 people from poor urban areas in Bogotá: 757 women and 254 men. Of these, 57 percent of women and 62 percent of men are in the age range of 18-39 years, and 43 percent of women and 57 percent of men have between 40-60 years.

In terms of level of education, 81 percent of men and 77 percent of women who participated in this research study has some secondary education or has completed higher education. In contrast, less than a third of the people in the sample – 18 percent of women and 23 percent of the men – have a college degree. As for marital status, more than half of men (58 percent) and women (61 percent) of the samples are married or with a partner.

74 percent of men in the sample reported being the household's primary earner, while half of women were considered themselves as such (53 percent). Of the sample of women, only 43 percent has earned income as part of their employment and the majority (75 percent) receives it in cash.

3.2 Landscape of access to and use of information and communications platforms (ICTs, internet)

Gender differences about how, where and why women and men use technology or the internet is not pronounced among respondents. However, it can be seen some significant gaps in the use of some technology such as computers – 67 percent of women vs. 74 percent of men reported using computers in the last 6 months – and cell phone

owning – 56 percent of women, as opposed to 62 percent of men. However, 71 percent of women and 76 percent of men considered themselves internet users, a fairly high figure that demonstrates the interest in this medium.

There is a correlation between age group and level of education and access to and use of internet. With younger ages, people are more likely to access the internet, identifying a significant generation gap. Similarly, among the less educated, fewer people use of the web.

However, 27 percent of female internet users claim that they don't use the internet at all or more often due to time constraints, 13 percent of them understand that they do not have enough knowledge to do so, and 10 percent believe that high costs would prevent them to access it.

Using computers, as mentioned before, it is an activity that men do more often than women, although the use is quite high in general. In the survey sample, 90 percent of people who use computers considered themselves internet users. 45 percent of them has a secondary school degree or have tertiary education. As for mobile telephony, the study confirmed the widespread use of cellphones in the country. Among the women surveyed, 91 percent reported owning a cell phone, however, 56 percent of them own or have access to smartphones, as opposed to 62 percent of men. There is a clear correlation between being internet user and having a smartphone. Thus, half of the people in the sample who own or have access to cellular phone – 49 percent of women and 53 percent of men – noted more frequent use of it is for making or receiving calls and text messages, and for online communication (i.e. Facebook, Skype, WhatsApp).

Among survey respondents, the internet is accessed primarily through cell phones. 62 percent of women using internet do so almost daily from their phone.

78 percent of male internet users pay for the costs associated with internet access, as opposed to only 50 percent of female users. Moreover, 29 percent of women married or in partnership, reported that their spouses or partners pay the internet access cost. This figure gives an indication that there is still more to do in the country in order to make women economically independent. The average weekly expenditure on internet access or mobile phone of 36 percent of female users may exceed COP 15,000. On the expenditure on mobile calls, 22 percent of female users pay on a weekly average between COP 5,000 and COP 10,000.

With regard to how internet is used and accessed, the study shows that Facebook is the most utilised social media service (84 percent), followed by WhatsApp (69 percent) and YouTube (50 percent). Men make more use of social media than women, although the gap is not substantial. But being young is significant when it comes to using social media. As for Facebook, it is observed young people have a more inten-

sive use of it, but it is noted that the use is quite significant among older people. Face-book and YouTube are more frequently accessed through cell phone, reaffirming the popularity of mobile internet in the country. On the other hand, more than half of the people surveyed claim to use Facebook every day. If this is added to those who only use Facebook a few days a week, 90 percent of the people surveyed has intensively used this platform.

The data highlight that owning or accessing a mobile phone has an influence in the frequency at which a person uses Facebook. However, 50 percent of persons surveyed with no access to a cell phone are frequent Facebook user. Despite the fact that 83 percent of female internet users use Facebook, 37 percent of them have never followed a link outside Facebook. The survey data does not reveal whether the reason why they are not following a link is because their connection prevents them from doing so (e.g. internet.org or free internet) or because they are not interested. But the data show that the percentage is high enough to conclude that many women simply access to the internet to go to Facebook, whether to stay in contact with friends, family or other acquaintances (92 percent), to make or connect with new friends (29 percent), to pass time (28 percent), or for entertainment (23 percent).

3.3 State of women's empowerment on and through the web

As mentioned above, 71 percent of women surveyed are internet users, but what value do they see on the web? This study shows that there is still a long way to go to not only consider the internet as valuable tool for finding information, for expression and for the exercise of rights, but also for using it as an empowerment tool. Thus, it is observed that although half of female internet users find value in using it for certain activities (52 percent to get help, emotional support or practical advice, and 49 percent to post comments about social, economic or political issues) the internet is more valuable for 68 percent of them to find entertainment content and 61 percent to help their families in school subjects. The use of social media, in addition, is not associated with political or citizen participation, social activism, income or content generation, job search, etc.

In fact, only 19 percent of women surveyed have used the internet to find information about sexual and reproductive health, 20 percent on legal rights, and 14 percent on gender based violence support services. Although the gap is not big, men surveyed seem to be using more frequently the internet and social media to find information. In general, the age group and educational level do appear to be decisive for using internet for searching information: the younger and more educated the person, the greater value and use he/she makes of the internet.

The study also shows that the internet is a tool for entertainment (i.e. listening to music through YouTube) or connecting with others, whether of the same or opposite gender, primarily through social media, particularly Facebook. And this trend is supported by popular mobile operator offers of free chat and/or social media packages, including internet.org. It is likely, then, that many of the women surveyed have limited their experience to social networks, as 37 percent out of the 83 percent of female Facebook users have never followed a link outside Facebook.

Women's agency and safety

From the women surveyed, few use the web as a tool to increase their civic and political participation, or to find relevant information. For example, 64 percent and 66 percent of women surveyed have never used the web to find information about their legal rights or to find out about gender based violence (GBV) support services, respectively. In health, 39 percent of women surveyed have never used the internet to learn about sexual and reproductive health. The preferred means for seeking information is, for 32 percent of them, through health workers and health facilities.

With regards to privacy, security and safety online, only 38 percent of women surveyed believe that online tools (i.e. Facebook, YouTube, WhatsApp) allow them to have a more secure space to express themselves. However, apart from two young, single and educated women, the women surveyed did not appear to know or understand the inherent privacy and security problems of the internet, as the vast majority of them show no concerns about this issue.

On the other hand, the study shows a more encouraging picture in terms of gender and technology. 62 percent of women surveyed believe that women and men have equal opportunity to access the internet. The vast majority of these women also believe that there should be no restrictions for a woman to use internet in public space (85 percent) or in accessing online content (89 percent). That is, the internet is commonly understood as a tool that is available on equal terms to men and women. The problem seems to be dissociation between the perceived value of this tool and the practices followed when using it.

Despite the fact that 71 percent of women are internet users, only 5 percent reported experiencing, at least once, threats or direct personal bullying when using the internet (mainly through Facebook) or cell phones. The experience of online violence has led 32 percent of these women to self-censor, or has driven them to block or unfriend people they do not like to interact with online.

The study's qualitative research, meanwhile, was focused on diagnosing and analyzing online gender based violence (GBV) within Colombia's journalism. Hence, it was observed that women journalists experience innumerable cases of violence,

for the work they do, but above all for being a woman. In recognizing that violence, however, there is a dissociation of the cause (journalism) and the form (gender). Violence has become naturalized in this profession. That is, the violence received by this group is not recognized as gender-based, but as part of the job.

Women journalists report the characteristics of online harassment as including:

- Messages conveying sexist stereotypes, aggressive, sexual, where the body is the weapon and battleground for this type of violence.
- The disqualification is routine, family and personal relationships messing with their children –, as well as the physical appearance, are constantly mentioned to intimidate or attack.
- Bullying does not fall on the ideas, the arguments, but rather on the fact that it is a woman who expresses an opinion, who has a say.

Moreover, it was identified that the topics that most often trigger violence against women journalists are those addressing the rights of women or of the LGBTI community, on gender and feminism, denouncing sexism and machismo in society, or on political content.

The effects of such violence on women journalists are personal, and include:

- Changing habits such as closing online and social media accounts or self-censorship, as well as switching their journalistic practices to offline platforms because the web is conceived as a violent environment, which can creates greater underrepresentation of women reports and women's views in online media.
- Using of nicknames and pseudonyms to avoid the debate to be personalized and to turn violent.
- Retweeting violent messages with the aim of drawing attention to and/or expose the aggressor.
- Blocking aggressors' accounts, reporting to authorities and/or social media services.
- Increasing levels of stress and feelings of fear and vulnerability, among others.

But few actions contain this violence.

Meanwhile, the state response to complaints of online threats or bullying turns out to be very slow or nonexistent. Law enforcement officials receiving such complaints usually do not know how to handle them, have precarious resources or do not understand the threats, as for them they seem to have no real consequences on the vic-

tim. In addition, the advice that women journalists get from their personal and work environment (i.e. co-workers, family, friends), while well-meaning, tend to recommend to ignore the attacks, and they are usually advised not to worry. Women journalists who participated in the study also identified that the academia shows apathy to this situation. The general perception as result of this research is that the role of women on the internet, even educated women and very high online profiles, have to be passive and quiet, should not break out the status quo, otherwise, having a voice and express it in digital platforms is the cause of this violence.

It can be concluded, then, that there is great ignorance by all, victims, authorities and society in general, on how online gender-based violence is manifested, particularly against women journalists. It could also be said that the number of women surveyed who experience have experienced violence on the internet may actually be higher than reported, in the first place, because women may not understand the sense of harm, violation and/or sexism they've experienced as harassment, and secondly, because their online practices show that the internet is not used as a space for the full exercise of rights, for expression, for citizen and political participation, for social activism, etc. In contrast, use of the web is limited to social activities and entertainment. In this regard, much remains to be done to promote the use of technology and the internet as tools for women's empowerment and for a safe space to exercise rights.

<u>Public institutional participation (particularly in the context of urban poverty)</u>

It is indisputable that technologies and the internet are tools that help advancing citizen participation. States are starting to recognize this through their digital agendas, where, among many aspects, they want to promote good governance through the use of ICT. In Colombia and in particular in the context of urban poverty demographics, the challenges are not a minor issue, because the political and citizen involvement of people surveyed in important community or country affairs is very small. For example, the survey results showed that 70 percent of women surveyed have never attended a community meeting, 84 percent have never signed a petition, and 84 percent have never contacted a local government officer or office. A vast majority of women have not been motivated to call to a radio phone-in show or write a letter to a newspaper. The internet is not yet used as a tool for expressing any opinion on important or controversial issues for two thirds of the women surveyed. The picture is not very different for men, although a slight difference is noted: 35 percent of men surveyed have actually used the web to express their views on important or controversial matters.

Perhaps the absence or inefficiency of government responses on citizen interest issues can explain the apathy and indifference of the women surveyed on topic such as corruption (75 percent have never reported a case of corruption) and related to their community (69 percent have never expressed their views on issues of impor-

tance). In contrast, 14 percent of women surveyed have report of corruption cases to the police, while 16 percent of them have express their opinion on issues facing their neighborhood to community leaders. A mere 8 percent of the women surveyed only uses internet as a means of expression of views on important issues for the country.

As said, the challenge of putting into practice the value already recognized on the internet is not minor. And <u>reconciling the labor and social time of women</u> with the use of the internet as a space for their empowerment and the exercise of their rights could be the biggest challenge.

Access to associational/collective action spaces

The local panorama, as mentioned before, indicates that women surveyed know the importance and value of public and online space for action and participation. However, their participation in collective/community activities is not particularly high. For example, only 21 percent of women surveyed have organized once or more community activities. And only 15 percent of them have participated in political meetings and activities.

Now, the internet, in particular online tools like Facebook, Youtube or WhatsApp, is considered for 38 percent of these women, half of them being internet users, a safer place to express themselves. Of these, only one-third of them have actually used social media as a means of expression on important or controversial matters. This reaffirms what it has been said so far, the internet is not a space of citizen or political participation, but it is a place for consumption. And this practice conflicts with the value they do see in the web as a tools for building citizenship and for empowerment.

Much remains to be done for the internet to be considered as space where freedom of expression online could flourish. But the picture is not entirely dark. 81 percent of women surveyed believe that all people have digital rights that they should fulfill without any interference. Moreover, 87 percent of them believed that people should be free to express themselves without risk of being attacked by it. Hence, they recognize internet as space for the realization of digital rights.

However, 66 percent of women surveyed believe that the government should be able to establish controls on what the can publish. Even more, a surprisingly half of women agree that the government can censor the media. Thus, there is clash on the exercise of freedom of expression of individuals vis-a-vis media freedom.

Access to economic opportunity

The digital economy is not longer an anecdotic issue. The internet, in fact, is a tool for generating productive activities for many people and in many jobs. From this study it is identified that 67 percent of female internet users have working email and half

Women's rights online

of them say they have used the internet for job hunting. However, the situation is not entirely satisfactory because only a meager 13 percent of female internet users have seen their incomes increase due to the internet.

There is no discussion in Colombia of the idea that the internet is an economic opportunity for small enterprises. There is the need to create incentives that encourage, for instance, the woman who sells vegetables on the street to imagine how the internet can make her work more efficient. Perhaps using a chat tool can facilitate her communication with vegetable distributors, making this to increase her daily sales. Therefore, a way to help these women to create and/or expand their incomes and economically and politically empower them could be through capacity building programmes intended to provide solutions that meet their most urgent needs and create incentives to think of new ideas about how the internet can assist a homemaker, a street vendor, or a housemaid.

4. POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

The study shows that women's experience in accessing to and using the internet in Colombia is far from ideal. It is necessary for public policy to address this problem through the adjustment of state programmes.

In principle, the study demonstrates that, regardless of socioeconomic status, Colombian women are connected to the internet. Although traditionally, the connection cost is considered the most important disincentive reason for accessing the internet in Colombia, the survey seems to prove that, no matter the cost, even the vast majority of people in poor urban communities manage to access the web. The problem with this statement is that, according to the study (which confirms official statistics), the connection is essentially through mobile internet. Therefore, the conclusion must be read to recognise that there are "zero rating" plans in Colombia. Consequently, we must ask how many of these connections are not really to the internet but to specific online services? The extensive use of WhatsApp and especially Facebook, two of the main players in the "zero rating" in Colombia, that appear on the survey findings, seems to reaffirm the doubt. With the survey data, it is not possible to establish the scope of zero-rating plans to establish the portion of these women who are only accessing to and using few online services and not the internet. Despite this, there is no doubt about the extent of internet access among these women.

In any case, the number of female internet users (leaving aside whether in practice this is real or not) can establish that even in underprivileged communities, the internet is already a reality. What is still missing is the match between the value of the internet as a tool for empowerment and the realization of rights, and use practices.

An important survey finding is to establish that women use the internet primarily as a tool for their social relations/activities – to connect with family and friends –, to meet new people, and for entertainment. Few of them use it as a political tool to inform and to be informed. Based on this conclusion, there is an opportunity to address the challenge of expanding the use of the internet as a democratic tool and to empower women if the government includes the gender perspective in its digital agenda. Until now, none of the programs developed under this agenda addressed the distances in ICT and gender as a variable to consider. Although it is suggested and proposed as a crosscutting issue, it has not been effectively developed. The results of this survey can be used to implement actions that encourage, enable and promote internet use beyond social relations/activities and entertainment as suggested below, and which allow to recognize particularity such as a significant portion of the women surveyed say that is their partner who covers the connection cost.

If we think that most of the women are connected via cell phone and say, with a large majority, Facebook is the online service par excellence, many of them without leaving the portal, the tendency to modify this behavior and develop more autonomous and empowered women is resulting in a public policy problem.

On the other hand, women's access to and use of the internet is large, but the survey findings show that they are unaware of the risks they face on the internet and, therefore, do not take self-protection measures. This panorama must be reviewed before the Colombian digital agenda, which include programs to prevent security risks for all Colombians (En TIC Confío) and in particular for the protection of children and youth (Te Protejo). The study demonstrates there is an urgency of addressing the unique and specific challenges of gender-based violence in the digital environment, as in Colombia, a large portion of the female population is highly vulnerable and is far from being aware of the internet-related risks. However, due to the fact that the internet usage of this population is closely linked to areas where there is no empowering process, nor a vision of the internet as an information tool and for the exercise of rights, if these risks would be addressed with an overly cautious view, the effect may be counterproductive. Government programmes addressing technology-related risks have essentially that approach: do not address internet as a space for the exercise of rights, energizing and empowering. The survey finding is forcing the government to think about programmes that react to gender-based violence, balancing risks and opportunities.

Surely, there is great value in that people can entertain and connect with their families and friends, but when their ability to go further and take advantage of skills and exercise democratic rights on the web is compromised, the state should make adjustment of public policy:

- 1. Revise its digital agenda to ensure that gender concerns and priorities are mainstreamed.
- 2. Develop indicators to assess and establish the real internet access of Colombians, particularly women, in order to develop appropriate policy responses that encourage a wider range of internet usage possibility for citizen participation and for women's empowerment.
- 3. Include internet and ICT capacity development and literacy training in education processes in order to enhance internet usage for citizen participation and for women's empowerment and not only for employment and job skills.
- 4. Reassess its support for "zero rating" programs i.e. internet.org as a mechanism to achieve universal internet access. The truth is that, although they offer an entry to the web, they are not the first step for taking advantages of the democratic potential of the internet; on the contrary, they create dependency and resignation to a limited option of services.
- 5. Increase capacity and awareness amongst law enforcement authorities responsible for responding to reports of online gender-based violence. This should go hand in hand with awareness campaigns to galvanize citizens' reaction, in particular men, against this violence and provide advice on how to react to them.

REFERENCES

- Alta Consejería Presidencial para la Equidad de la Mujer (2012). Lineamientos de la política pública nacional de equidad de género para las mujeres. Retrieve from http://www.equidadmujer.gov.co/Documents/Lineamientos-politica-publica-equidad-de-genero.pdf.
- Alta Consejería Presidencial para la Equidad de la Mujer (2011, May 25). *Mujer tienes derechos, estamos contigo*. Retrieve from http://historico.equidadmujer.gov.co/Noticias/2011/Paginas/110525a.aspx.
- Alta Consejería Presidencial para la Equidad de la Mujer (n.d.). Política pública nacional de equidad de género para las mujeres y el plan integral para garantizar a las mujeres una vida libre de violencias. Retrieve from http://www.equidadmujer.gov.co/ejes/Paginas/politica-publica-de-equidad-de-genero.aspx.
- Aulas TIC: Más tecnología para las mujeres de Bogotá (2014, May 20). Retrieve from http://www.mintic.gov.co/portal/604/w3-article-6127.html.
- Castañeda, J.D. (2015, January 30). The dangerous ambiguity of communications encryption rules in Colombia. *Digital Rights Latin America and the Caribbean*, 19. Retrieve from http://www.digitalrightslac.net/en/la-peligrosa-ambigue-dad-de-las-normas-sobre-cifrado-de-comunicaciones-en-colombia/.
- Castillo Vargas, E. (2014). Violencia contra las mujeres y TIC (VCM y TIC). *DoKumento 3*. Retrieve from https://karisma.org.co/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/VC-MyTIC.pdf.
- Colnodo & Fundación Karisma (2014). *Actuemos para denunciar la violencia contra las mujeres en entornos digitales*. Retrieve from http://denuncia.dominemoslatecno-logia.org/es/inicio.
- Colnodo (2014, December 23). Más de 400 MujeresTIC reciben su certificación en Kennedy. Retrieve from http://www.colnodo.apc.org/novedades.shtml?apc=k-xx-1-&x=5756.
- Comisión de Regulación de Comunicaciones (2014). *Informe de la Sociedad de la Información*. Retrieve from http://www.evaluamos.com/2006/PDF/Informe_Sociedad_Informacion_v2.pdf.
- Constitución Política de Colombia (1991). Retrieve from http://www.constitucioncolom-bia.com/.
- Departamento Administrativo Nacional de Estadística (2005). *Informe especial: Censo General* 2005. *Educación Colombia*. Retrieve from http://www.dane.gov.co/censo/files/boletines/bol_educacion.pdf.

- En TIC Confio website available on http://www.enticconfio.gov.co/.
- Fundación Karisma & FLiP (2015, July 6). *Corte Constitucional colombiana decide sobre caso de derecho al olvido en Internet*. Retrieve from https://karisma.org.co/corte-constitucional-colombiana-decide-sobre-caso-de-derecho-al-olvido-en-internet/.
- Gillula, J. & Malcolm, J. (2015, May 18). *Internet.org is not neutral, not secure, and not the internet*. Retrieve from https://www.eff.org/deeplinks/2015/05/internetorg-not-neutral-not-secure-and-not-internet.
- Ley de actividades de inteligencia y contrainteligencia. Law No. 1621 of April 17, 2013, Paragraph 2, Article 44 Retrieve from http://wsp.presidencia.gov.co/Normativa/Leyes/Documents/2013/LEY%201621%20DEL%2017%20DE%20ABRIL%20DE%202013.pdf.
- Medidas para garantizar el acceso a la justicia de las mujeres víctimas de violencia sexual, en especial la violencia sexual con ocasión del conflicto armado. Law No. 1719 of June 18, 2014. Retrieve from http://wsp.presidencia.gov.co/Normativa/Leyes/Documents/LEY%201719%20DEL%2018%20DE%20JUNIO%20DE%202014.pdf.
- Ministerio de las Tecnologías de la Información y las Comunicaciones (2015). *Boletín trimestral de las TIC: cifras primer trimestre 2015*. Retrieve from http://colombiatic.mintic.gov.co/602/articles-11128 archivo pdf.pdf.
- Ministerio de las Tecnologías de la Información y las Comunicaciones (2014, September 18). *En octubre arranca gira nacional de conferencias En Tic Confio*. Plan Vive Digital. Retrieve from http://www.mintic.gov.co/portal/604/w3-article-7143.html.
- Ministerio del Interior y de Justicia (2011). *Ley de víctimas y restitución de tierras*. Retrieve from http://www.unidadvictimas.gov.co/normatividad/LEY+DE+VICTI-MAS.pdf.
- Ministerio de las Tecnologías de la Información y las Comunicaciones (n.d.). Programa de capacitación en TIC. *Plan Vive Digital*. Retrieve from http://www.mintic.gov.co/portal/vivedigital/612/w3-propertyvalue-670.html.
- Mujeres Digitales webpage available on http://www.mujeresdigitales.org/index.php.
- Normas de sensibilización, prevención y sanción de formas de violencia y discriminación contra las mujeres. Law No. 1257 of December 4, 2011. Retrieve from http://www.alcaldiabogota.gov.co/sisjur/normas/Norma1.jsp?i=34054.
- ONU Mujer (2015). ¿Camino a la igualdad? Derechos de las mujeres a partir de la Constitución de 1991. Retrieve from http://colombia.unwomen.org/~/media/field%20 office%20colombia/documentos/publicaciones/2015/camino%20a%20la%20 igualdad reedicion2015.pdf.

- Plan Nacional de Desarrollo 2010-2014. Law No. 1450 of June 11, 2011. Retrieve from https://colaboracion.dnp.gov.co/CDT/Normatividad/ley145016062011.pdf.
- Plan Nacional de Desarrollo 2014-2018. Law No. 1753 of June 9, 2015. Retrieve from http://www.alcaldiabogota.gov.co/sisjur/normas/Norma1.jsp?i=61933.
- Privacy International (2015). *Shadow state: surveillance, law and order in Colombia*. Retrieve from https://www.privacyinternational.org/sites/default/files/ShadowState_English.pdf.
- Resolution No. 3502 of December 16, 2011. Retrieve from http://www.alcaldiabogota.gov.co/sisjur/normas/Norma1.jsp?i=45061#0.
- Te Protejo website available on http://www.teprotejo.org/index.php/en/.
- Ramírez Peña, A. (2015, March 30). *Brecha salarial de género en Colombia es más un mito*. El Tiempo. Retrieve from http://www.eltiempo.com/economia/empresas/brechas-salariales-de-genero/15488317.
- Zero Rating (n.d.). Wikipedia. Retrieve from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zero-rating.

METHODOLOGY ANNEX

Co-authored by Daniel Cameron, Sidra Butt, and Jennifer Keyes from Ipsos MORI and World Wide Web Foundation staff.

Background

This research is part of a 10-country study on Closing the Gender Gap in ICT Data and Policymaking: ICTs for empowerment of women and girls funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA). The study was managed by the World Wide Web Foundation and conducted collaboratively between WWWF, Ipsos MORI and WWWF partner organisations located in each of the 10 countries.

Overview of the Survey Methodology

The World Wide Web Foundation commissioned Ipsos MORI to conduct a household face-to-face survey in urban poor areas in cities in 10 countries. The aim of the study was to gather data on women's use of ICTs and the internet. The survey was conducted in the capital cities or main economic hubs of 10 countries. Cities included: Nairobi, Kampala, Yaoundé, Maputo, Lagos, Greater Cairo, Bogota, Jakarta, New Delhi and Manila.

Ideally, nationally representative surveys, or at least an equally representative sample of rural areas as well as urban areas would have been preferable. However, due to resource and time constraints the surveys were conducted using quota sampling stratified to focus on an urban poor demographic in capital or key cities.

A quota sample of 1,000 face-to-face interviews was completed with 250 men and 750 women living in poor, urban areas. The focus of the data collection was on women,

hence the larger sample of women and smaller sample of men. The latter – albeit relatively small sample – is useful for comparative purposes and to provide indication of the gender gap in ICT and internet use in each city.

A mixture of Computer Assisted Personal Interviewing (CAPI) and Paper Assisted Personal Interviewing (PAPI) was used to collect the survey data.

Country	Fieldwork City	Data Collection Method
Cameroon	Yaoundé	CAPI
Colombia	Bogota	PAPI
Egypt	Greater Cairo	PAPI
India	New Delhi	CAPI
Indonesia	Jakarta	PAPI
Kenya	Nairobi	CAPI
Mozambique	Maputo	CAPI
Nigeria	Lagos	CAPI
Philippines	Manila	CAPI
Uganda	Kampala	CAPI

The World Wide Web Foundation (WWWF) drafted the survey and worked collaboratively with Ipsos MORI to refine and translate the questionnaire and design the sampling frameworks. WWWF partners in each country conducted pilot surveys prior to the full survey in order to refine further the final questionnaire and strengthen the implementation of the full survey. Ipsos MORI country offices were responsible for overall management of the data collection and data processing.

Questionnaire

The questionnaire covered topics relating to women and men's access to, use of, and perceived value of the internet and ICTs. It also looked specifically at the barriers women face in accessing the internet, where and how women access public information and information on women's rights (including sexual health information and related health services, information on legal rights, gender based violence information and support services). The questionnaire also addressed women's use of the internet for education, employment and political activity such as voicing opinion and collectively organising on public issues. The questionnaire also looked at women's experiences of harassment via mobile phones and online, uses of social media and perceived value of the web and internet to daily life.

A master questionnaire was finalised in English, and was then translated by each Ipsos MORI country field office in the local language (see list below). The translated questionnaires were then checked by a local-language translator and back-checked into English. The World Wide Web Foundation Women's Rights Online country partners also reviewed, edited, translated and approved the translations of the questionnaire.

Country	Language of Translation
Cameroon	French
Colombia	Spanish
Egypt	Arabic
India	Hindi
Indonesia	Indonesian
Kenya	Swahili
Mozambique	Portuguese
Nigeria	English
Philippines	Tagalog
Uganda	Luganda

The final questionnaires were sent to CAPI scripting teams based in Nairobi, Kenya to be programmed using the Survey To Go / Dooblo application that uses Dimensions software.

The local language links were tested by the Ipsos MORI country research teams to ensure that the questionnaire had been programmed correctly, including logic checks built in to avoid data errors and to minimise the need for data cleaning at the end of fieldwork. The process of testing underwent several rounds of error-checking to ensure that the structure and content of the survey applications for all countries were standard.

Ethical Code of Conduct

As a market and social research company, Ipsos MORI abides by the ICC/ESOMAR Code on market and social research. ESOMAR is the world organisation for market and social research, a copy of the guidelines can be found here.

Ipsos MORI's market and social research services meet the requirements of ISO 9001:2008, the international standard for Quality Management Systems; ISO 20252:2006, the international Market Research Standard, which incorporates the In-

terviewer Quality Control Scheme; ISO 27001:2005, the international standard for Information Security Management Systems.

Ipsos MORI and all fieldwork partners in this project comply with the ESOMAR International Code of Marketing and Social Research Practice. The research was carried out in accordance with the ICC/ESOMAR International Code of Marketing and Social Research Practice.

Informed Consent

The questionnaire required fieldworkers to obtain verbal informed consent before conducting any interviews. Research participants were provided with a verbal and written overview of the purpose, goals and objectives of the study; assuring they were selected at random. Research participants were assured of their anonymity and privacy in completing the survey. Any participant who declined to give verbal consent to participate in the survey was not interviewed.

Pilot Test of the Survey

A pilot phase was conducted between 28th April and 9th May to test the questionnaire in all countries, with the exception of Egypt where the survey was piloted between 10 and 11 June 2015. The pilot in Egypt was slightly delayed due to the time required to obtain government approval of the questionnaire and study as required from the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS).

In all cases the pilot was conducted by World Wide Web Foundation's country partners in the respective countries (see list below). Pilot feedback was then used to make revisions to improve the question wording, the translation of certain questions and the flow of the questionnaire.

Country	Fieldwork City	Pilot conducted by Partner Organisation
Cameroon	Yaoundé	I-Vission International
Colombia	Bogota	Fundación Karisma
Egypt	Greater Cairo	Tadween Gender Research Centre/Harass- Map
India	New Delhi	IT for Change and Centre for Advocacy and Research (CFAR)
Indonesia	Jakarta	ICT Watch
Kenya	Nairobi	International Association of Women in Radio and Television

Country	Fieldwork City	Pilot conducted by Partner Organisation
Mozambique	Maputo	Science Innovation Information and Communication Technology Research Institute (SIITRI)
Nigeria	Lagos	Paradigm Initiative Nigeria
Philippines	Manila	Foundation for Media Alternatives
Uganda	Kampala	Women of Uganda Network (WOUGNET)

Sampling Frameworks

List of Areas Sampled

Sector	Localidad	Sub location / Area
4519	Bosa	CANAVERALEJO RURAL
4543	Bosa	OSORIO XXIII
4526	Bosa	SAN BERNARDINO XXV
2530	Ciudad Bolívar	JUAN PABLO II
2565	Ciudad Bolívar	VERONA
2417	Ciudad Bolívar	CASA DE TEJA 1
2560	Ciudad Bolívar	PARAISO QUIBA
2416	Ciudad Bolívar	SIERRA MORENA
2524	Ciudad Bolívar	POTOSI
2561	Ciudad Bolívar	PERDOMO ALTO
2420	Ciudad Bolívar	PRIMAVERA II
2418	Ciudad Bolívar	QUINTAS DEL SUR
2563	Ciudad Bolívar	NACIONES UNIDAS
2558	Ciudad Bolívar	LUCERO DEL SUR 2
2422	Ciudad Bolívar	BRAZUELOS OCCIDENTAL
2425	Ciudad Bolívar	JUAN JOSE RONDON
2521	Ciudad Bolívar	LAS ACACIAS 2
2559	Ciudad Bolívar	LOS TRES REYES
2423	Ciudad Bolívar	SANTA VIVIANA
2414	Ciudad Bolívar	LAS ACACIAS 1
2523	Ciudad Bolívar	SUMAPAZ
2525	Ciudad Bolívar	BRISAS DEL VOLADOR

Sector	Localidad	Sub location / Area
2519	Ciudad Bolívar	LOS LAURELES II
2424	Ciudad Bolívar	SAN ANTONIO DEL MIRADOR
2421	Ciudad Bolívar	GALICIA
2517	Ciudad Bolívar	LUCERO DEL SUR 1
5637	Engativá	EL DORADO INDUSTRIAL
4542	Kennedy	EL JAZMIN
2526	Rafael Uribe	SAN AGUSTIN
2567	Rafael Uribe	MARCO FIDEL SUAREZ II
2510	Rafael Uribe	MARCO FIDEL SUAREZ I
2568	Rafael Uribe	CARMEN DEL SOL
1306	San Cristobal	CANADA O GUIRA
1106	San Cristobal	VELODROMO
9204	Suba	CIUDAD HUNZA
8535	Usaquén	BOSQUE DE PINOS
8534	Usaquén	LA ESTRELLITA
8504	Usaquén	LA CITA
2551	Usme	YOMASA
1328	Usme	DESARROLLO BRAZUELOS I
2555	Usme	ELVIRREY
2553	Usme	LA PICOTA 1
2549	Usme	TIBAQUE II
2541	Usme	LA ORQUIDEA DE USME
1329	Usme	LA CABANA
1325	Usme	YOMASA NORTE
2564	Usme	CHAPINERITO
2532	Usme	VILLA DIANA
2540	Usme	SERRANIAS I
2545	Usme	ARRAYANES I
2550	Usme	CHUNIZA
2539	Usme	LOS ARRAYANES II

The targeted sample size was 1,000 respondents, including pre-determined quota of 750 women and 250 men in urban poor areas in ten capital or main cities. The target age group was 18 - 60 years, which included assigned quotas per specific age brackets, largely in line with country demographic patterns where national statistics allowed.

Final sample size

Total	1011
Men	254
Women	757

The following data was collected and organised for each country sampling plan:

- Population size of sampling city (urban only) for population ages 18 60 years only
- The population size was organised by age and gender (where available)
- List of eligible sampling areas (slum dwelling/ informal settlements)
- Estimated population size of each area (if available for ages 18 -60 years)
- Maps showing outline/borders of sampling areas and highlighting key landmarks within each sampling area

Population data was collected from publically available sources and preferably from the most recent national census in each country. The data sources for the quotas in each city are listed below for reference.

Population Data Sources for each country

Country	Data Source
Colombia	2013 - Dane Bogotá D.C.: Pobreza Monetaria Comunicado de prensa
Cameroon	2005 - Source BUCREB: Data from RGPH - Yaoundé Urban Council
Egypt	2006 - Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS) National Census
India	2011 - National Census - The Registrar General & Census Commissioner, India
Indonesia	2010 - National Census - Central Bureau of Statistics
Kenya	2009 - Census data - Kenya National Bureau of Statistics
Mozambique	2007 - Instituto Nacional De Estatistica – Moçambique, Census Data
Nigeria	2006 - National Bureau of Statistics /National Population Commission (NPC)

Country	Data Source
Philippines	2010 - National Statistics Office (NSO) - Census Data
Uganda	2014 National Slum Dwellers Federation Of Uganda, Slum Profiles In Kampala

In the following countries, population information was only available at a city-regional level and not at a sub-location level:

- **1. Cameroon** Yaoundé city divided into seven regions; Yaoundé sections one to seven and further into pre-defined clusters.
- 2. Egypt Cairo city divided into 14 regions and further into sub locations.
- 3. India Delhi State defined geographically into five districts / regions, Central, North, South, East & West Delhi and then further divided into sub locations
- **4. Indonesia** Jakarta city defined geographically into five regions, Central, North, South, East & West Jakarta. Each region is divided into districts and then further into villages and neighbourhoods, known as Rukun Tetangga (RT) and Rukun Warga (RW)
- **5. Nigeria** Lagos city divided into 6 regions and a further 9 sub locations. Clusters were created within each sub location.

Quotas for these cities were assigned proportionately to the population size at the lowest available level of geography. These quotas were then divided equally across the sub-locations in each region.

For all other cities, Bogota, Kampala, Manila, Maputo and Nairobi, population data was available for sub-locations and quotas were designed based on this level.

Sampling stages

Stage 1

- Field offices made a list of ALL applicable urban poor areas (slum dwelling/informal settlements) within the capital city boundaries.
- All areas listed met the criteria of urban, poor settlements where the majority
 of the population lives below the poverty line.
- Areas that were classified as unsafe or difficult to access were excluded from the listing.
- Where available, each field office provided the estimated population sizes for each sampling area, listed by city region or district and then by sub location.

Stage 2

Quotas were calculated and assigned proportionate to the applicable population for the sampling regions and sub locations (where available) by age and gender. The quotas were also assigned based on the population profile information available.

Stage 3

- Using Google Maps and/or readily available maps, the boundaries of each sampling area were highlighted
- In countries where maps were unavailable, ground teams surveyed the sampling areas and, with the assistance local administrative leaders, noted landmarks to identify the boundaries of the sampling areas.
- The field supervisor / managers then assigned their team with sampling areas according to the sample and the necessary sample quotas for each area.
- The field supervisor / managers allocated each team starting points within the sampling areas / clusters. These were spread out across the sampling area and assigned to each interviewer.

Stage 4

- In densely populated areas, after every successful interview, interviewers
 were asked to skip four households and find an interview every fifth house.
 In cases where they were unsuccessful in securing an interview, they went to
 the next household interval until they were successful.
- In a household where an interviewer found more than one person who was
 eligible and willing to participate in the study, the interviewer used the 'birthday rule' and interviewed the man or woman whose birthday had passed
 most recently.
- The number of interviews achieved around each starting point was never more than 20.
- The details of the sampling region, sub location, starting point / landmark etc. were recorded for every interview.

Quota sampling

A key of aim of the study was to deliver high quality, quantitative data that is broadly representative of the target population in the ten cities selected for inclusion in the study. Quota sampling is a non-random sampling method and involves a fixed quota of interviews being set (within each sampling point⁸) on variables such as age and

gender to ensure the sample is broadly representative of the population of interest. Such quotas are based on the most up-to-date demographic profile of the population in each of the cities. Individual sampling units (households) were randomly selected within the predetermined urban poor areas in each city.

As part of the survey, interviewers asked potential interviewees a series of demographic screening questions to identify whether they fit the profile before continuing with the main survey. Drawing the sample in this way means that it is not possible to calculate selection probabilities, as would be the case in a random probability sampling approach. To reduce interviewer selection bias and increase the randomness of selection, interviewers are typically given a set of instructions to follow when selecting households, for example, to follow a particular route or skipping a number of households after successful completion of one interview.

For this survey, quota sampling was identified as the preferred survey methodology given the difficulty in obtaining a comprehensive sampling frame and because of time and budget constraints.

Survey Fieldwork

Interviewer training & briefing

Prior to fieldwork in the countries, the Ipsos MORI central project team members held telephone briefings with the project managers in each of country offices in conjunction with the World Wide Web Foundation project team. The telephone briefings were held between the 22nd and 28th April 2015.

The in-country project briefings were held over two to three days and consisted of intensive training sessions, held centrally, usually at the research agency offices. The training sessions in all countries (except Nigeria and Egypt) began on the week commencing 4th May 2015. Training in Nigeria was held in the week commencing 11th May 2015 and training in Egypt started on 10 June 2015.

The trainings were facilitated by the field managers, field coordinators and the World Wide Web Foundation's partners from local organisations in each country. After the questionnaire training session, a half-day pilot was completed. Pilot interviews were reviewed by the field manager, data manager and supervisors, together with the field interviewers, and any issues were raised and discussed during one-on-one sessions with interviewers.

Survey Fieldwork teams

The field team was made up of majority female interviewers due to the importance of women interviewing women and men interviewing men (gender matching criteria). The number of interviewers in each country was between 10 - 25 in total.

To comply with the gender matching interview criteria, female interviewers selected randomly from all female participants in the household, while male interviews selected randomly from all male participants in the household. All sections of the questionnaire were asked to each participant as applicable.

Survey Fieldwork dates

Fieldwork was completed over a four-week period between 11 May and 8 June with the exceptions of Egypt where fieldwork took place between 10 and 28 August. The reason for the delay in Egypt was that after obtaining official permission in June from CAPMAS to conduct the survey, the fieldwork had to be further postponed until after Ramadan and Eid holidays.

Survey Interview duration

The English version of the questionnaire was tested and took approximately 25-30 minutes to administer. Translated versions of the questionnaires ran for 30-35 minutes on average.

Substitution and replacement of sampling units

Field agencies were not authorised to substitute or replace any of the regions or sub locations from those listed and approved in the sampling plans. Any requests for substitution were submitted to the project manager and then assessed for replacement.

For example, in Nairobi (Kenya), the team went out into one of the sub locations in Kibera's region, Olympic. However, upon arrival they discovered that the area did not fit the qualities of an urban poor area and was too small to cover the sample set. After discussions with the project manager, approval was given to substitute Olympic and to transfer the sample to Gatwikira sub location.

All the other sampling units that were identified for this survey were successfully reached and interviews were conducted as per the target / assigned quotas.

Survey Fieldwork challenges and limitations

Despite fieldwork being successful, the following challenges were encountered during the data collection process:

• Safety and Security – Several interviewers expressed concerns about their personal security while conducting fieldwork in the slum areas. There were several incidences where participants were harsh and unwelcoming towards the interviewers. This may be largely attributed to concerns about safety in these areas where insecurity is high and 'outsiders' are viewed with suspicion.

- Environment In Kenya and Uganda, fieldwork was affected by heavy rains, which made access to the slum areas difficult. In New Delhi, the fieldwork period was disrupted due to a heat wave, which made travel and fieldwork extremely difficult. In Nigeria, a severe fuel shortage hindered and delayed fieldwork by one week.
- Refusals There were cases where participants, both potential and actual, demanded incentives to participate (no incentives were offered anywhere).
 Most of them however agreed to continue without it and there were only a few cases where participants refused to be interviewed on the basis that incentives were not being offered.
- Fieldwork in Egypt The Egyptian Government requires study permissions
 to conduct fieldwork in Egypt. The process of obtaining permissions led to
 initial delays in the study timeline for Egypt. We were also requested to remove or change (e.g. rephrase) the following parts of the questionnaire to
 obtain approval, which influenced the comparability of these survey questions across countries.
- The title of the survey which was "Survey on Women's Empowerment through the Internet" (changed to "Survey on using the Internet")
 - Option to select "Military Personnel" in the question on "type of employment" (removed)
 - Survey question on the personal value of the internet to practice religion (removed)
 - Survey question on where people have looked for information on drug and alcohol abuse (removed)
 - Question on where people have gone to report corruption (removed)
 - Questions on people's opinion about government regulation of media (removed)⁹ and media freedom (rephrased from "The media should have the right to publish views and ideas without government interference to "The media should have the right to publish views and ideas")
 - Reference to term "sexual" in terms of sexual harassment (re-translated as colloquial term for "harassment" which is commonly understood to include sexual harassment)

Quality control in Survey Research

Field checks

Quality control measures were implemented and included telephone callbacks, in addition to physical back-checks to some participants to validate some of their survey responses. Both telephone and physical checks were randomised, without any prior interviewer notification. Participants were asked for the gender of the interviewer that visited them, the length of the interview, the topic of the survey as well as a few main questions from the questionnaire. Participant screening information was also sometimes requested. On average, between 10 and 30% of participants were contacted through telephone call backs, while a minimum of 5% of participants were reached through physical back checks.

Country field offices were required to do a minimum of 10% back checks, however a large number of participants were often unreachable for telephonic back-checks. This was due to poor network coverage or a working telephone number not being available, among other reasons. To address this, telephonic back checks were often supplemented by supervisor-accompanied visits and return visits to the field.

Data & validation checks

During fieldwork, field supervisors often downloaded and checked data to ensure that any errors or queries could be flagged early. Data was received in real time as the CAPI devices were set to synchronize automatically. The data was then downloaded in the country offices and checked for completeness and validity.

The following checks were also implemented to ensure quality:

- GPS location services this was recorded using the CAPI devices in some countries. Back checkers were able to download the collected data and verify that the interviewers are indeed at the required sampling areas, as well as trace the routes they took.
- Interview length the data collection devices record the start and stop of every questionnaire, checking on questionnaire length. This is an important part of quality checks to identify outliers and surveys that would need to be further validated.

The interviews/cases found not to comply with the quality checks were removed from the data; some of the issues were supported by telephonic and field back checks.

Data processing

Once fieldwork checks were completed, the data was retrieved and downloaded for all countries and reformatted to ensure that the data structure for all countries was the same. This was to ensure comparability across all countries.

Ipsos MORI's data processing team then worked on labelling and processing the data before compiling data tables with the key variables across all countries. The variables for the data tables included:

- gender
- age

- internet use
- education
- marital status
- employment status
- personal mobile phone ownership
- mobile phone access,
- income/poverty level (includes: primary income earner, electricity available, cooking fuel type, ownership of mode of transport, type of floor in house, type of roof in the house)

Data tables were constructed in Excel format. The full merged data set containing the data for all countries was structured in SPSS format for additional analysis by the World Wide Web Foundation statistics team. The full results for each country are available via the World Wide Web Foundation website.

Qualitative Research Methodology

In addition to our 10-country survey research, Women's Rights Online country partner organisations designed and conducted qualitative research which included key informant interviews, focus group discussions, and issue-based case studies.

Among other purposes, the qualitative research was intended to:

- a) compliment the survey data through narrative and ethnographic techniques,
- b) delve deeper into specific topics identified as priorities by country partners,
- c) lend greater personal insight into the priority policy issues for women's rights online.

Oualitative research method

The qualitative research in Colombia was focused on digging deeper on gender-based violence faced by women journalists on the Internet. The ultimate goal of this research was to have the necessary elements to characterise the types of violence, know which mostly journalistic subject are triggering this violence, as well as the most common digital platforms where it occurs, the consequences and effects on women victims, and the reactions of persons close to the victim, government authorities and the online services, if any.

This research was developed in 4 phases: literature review, focus groups, online survey and data analysis. The first phase consisted of a preliminary investigation into the state of the art, in which the discussion on the subject in other regions and countries were reviewed. The next phase comprised the holding of 3 focus groups with

journalists. These focus groups took place on April 29 and May 6 and 27 in the city of Bogota. 25 persons participated – 23 women and 2 men –, coming mostly from Bogota, but also from Cali, Medellin and Pasto. All of them are active Internet users through their media work (e.g. news articles, op-eds, etc.), personal and job-related blogs, social media, etc.

For the third phase, the project team developed an online survey consisting of 14 questions, which was intended to complement the information gathered during the focus group. A total of 36 persons responded the survey – 26 women and 8 men –, which was open and available for a whole month.

The survey finding were crossed and analysed jointly with the information gathered during focus groups in the last research phase, confirming the same trends and practices that were identified in the first and second stages of this study.

Some Basic Assumptions

- Population data used in sampling frameworks is correct as per each country's most recent population census
- Urban poor areas are correctly identified based on local census and local knowledge

Limitations to the study

- The study is not fully representative of the male or female populations at national level:
 - The study excluded rural populations
 - The study excluded middle and higher income groups
 - The sample size of males interviewed was relatively small compared to the sample size of women interviewed, which means, among other things, that the margin of error for the results for the males interviewed is larger than that for the females.
- For several survey questions the answer options generated small numbers of respondents. We were cautious in the analysis of responses that generated less than 50 respondents in total, and considered any sample less than 50 to be too small to draw clear conclusions.

NOTES:

- 1. DANE, Proyecciones de población.
- 2. DANE.
- 3. Thirteen metropolitan areas are: Bogotá, Medellín, Cali, Barranquilla, Bucaramanga, Pereira, Pasto, Cúcuta, Manizales, Montería, Ibagué, Cartagena, and Villavicencio.
- 4. The five dimensions evaluated in the MPI are educational home conditions, childhood and youth, health, employment, access to public and residential services, and housing conditions.
- 5. The Ministry of ICT defines broadband internet as the fixed internet connections with an effective downloading speed greater than or equal to 1,024 Kbps + 3G and 4G Mobile internet.
- 6. This research study focused in understanding the access and use of web-enabled technology in socioeconomic strata 1 and 2 of Colombia.
- 7. The indicator evaluated annually are infrastructure and access to ICT; access and use of ICT in households and individuals; use of ICT by businesses; ICT in education; and e-Government
- 8. Sample Point" is a clearly defined, specific and unique area that an interviewer will go to achieve a fixed amount of interviews. Each could be a town, village, neighbourhood in a city, street etc.).
- 9. Survey question Q25-D "The government should have the right to prevent the media from publishing things that it considers harmful to society."